



BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS

DATE: July 22, 2008

AGENDA ITEM NO. 27

Consent Agenda ☐

Regular Agenda ☒

Public Hearing ☐

County Administrator's Signature:

Subject:

Ranking of Firms - Advertising & Promotional Services
Contract No. 078-0289-P (AM)

Department:

Convention & Visitors Bureau / Purchasing

Staff Member Responsible:

D T Minich / Joe Lauro

Recommended Action:

I RECOMMEND THE BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS (BOARD) APPROVE THE RANKING OF FIRMS AND AUTHORIZE STAFF TO NEGOTIATE WITH THE NUMBER ONE RANKED FIRM BIRDSALL, VOSS & ASSOCIATES, INC., TAMPA, FLORIDA.

Summary Explanation/Background:

On March 21, 2008, the Purchasing Department let a Request For Proposal (RFP) for Advertising & Promotional Services on behalf of the Convention & Visitors Bureau (CVB).

Proposals were received from sixteen (16) firms. On May 8, 2008, an Evaluation Committee consisting of three (3) staff members from the CVB, and three (3) members of the Tourist Development Council (TDC), along with a member of the Purchasing Department acting as a facilitator, met to evaluate and score the written submissions with the selected finalists to be invited to present their detailed proposals to the Evaluation Committee in person.

Four finalists were selected from the sixteen (16) proposals evaluated on May 8, 2008. These finalists, Birdsall, Voss & Associates, Inc., AKA Advertising D/B/A MMG Worldwide, FKQ Marketing, Inc., and Ypartnership, LLC were invited to present their proposals for the Evaluation Committee on June 5, 2008. Two (2) of the finalists, AKA Advertising, D/B/A MMG Worldwide, because of other commitments, and Ypartnership, LLC, the current provider, indicated they decided not to participate in the oral presentation.

The proposals were evaluated in the written submission phase of the process according to the following criteria:

- | | |
|---|------------|
| 1. Agency Background/expertise | 100 Points |
| 2. Financial Compliance | 50 Points |
| 3. Relevancy | 100 Points |
| 4. Case Histories | 200 Points |
| 5. Strategic Thinking/Creative Approach | 550 Points |

The firms in order of ranking for the first phase are as follow:

1. Birdsell, Voss & Associates, Inc.
2. FKQ Advertising + Marketing
3. AKA Advertising D/B/A MMG Worldwide
4. Ypartnership, LLC
5. Fahlgren, Inc.
6. Dalton Agency
7. Fry Hammond Barr, Inc.
8. Paradise Advertising & Marketing, Inc.
9. Rick Johnson & Company, Inc.
10. The Zimmerman Agency
11. TURKEL
12. Uzzell Group, Inc.
13. Brogan & Partners
14. Engauge Marketing, LLC
15. Marketing Innovations Enterprises, Inc.
16. PDG+Creative

The finalists were evaluated in the second phase according to the following criteria:

1. Differentiators	100 Points
2. Consumer Outcomes	100 Points
3. Brand Positioning Platform	200 Points
4. Brand Platform Creative Expression	200 Points
5. How To Verify	50 Points
6. Big Idea	100 Points
7. How To Further CVB's Business Goals	50 Points
8. Overall Quality Of Thinking And Perceived "Fit"	150 Points
9. Agency Cost	50 Points

The ranking of firms as noted above, was presented to the TDC for consideration on July 9, 2008. The TDC unanimously approved the ranking as presented by the evaluation committee.

At the direction of the Board, staff will begin negotiations with the number one ranked firm. Negotiations will be centered on fee structure.

Fiscal Impact/Cost/Revenue Summary:

Estimated Annual Cost to the County Prior to Negotiation: \$8,599,451.00

Funding will be provided through the Tourist Development Council (CVB's) Promotional Activities.

Exhibits/Attachments Attached:

1. Contract Review
2. Evaluation Criteria Tabulation



PURCHASING DEPARTMENT
CONTRACT REVIEW TRANSMITTAL

CATS
NO.:

25273

PROJECT: Advertising & Promotional Services

BID NUMBER: 078-0289-P (AM)

REQ. NUMBER: N/A

TYPE: ☐ Purchase Contract ☐ Other: ☐ Construction-Less than \$100,000 ☐ One Time

In accordance with the policy guide for Contract Administration, the attached documents are submitted for review and comment.

Upon completion of review, complete Contract Review Transmittal and forward to next Review Authority listed. Please indicate suggested changes by revising, in RED, the appropriate section of the document reflecting the exact wording of the change.

RISK MANAGEMENT: Please enter required liability coverage on pages: 11-12 PRODUCT ONLY ☐

This is an annual contract. Estimated Annual Expenditure for existing contract: \$9,608,817.00 (CVB: Please change if different)

REVIEW SEQUENCE	REVIEW AUTHORITY	REVIEW DATE	REVIEW SIGNATURE	COMMENTS (Attach Separate page if necessary)	COMMENTS INCORPORATED
1.	Purchasing Dept. Amelia McFarlane, PA Joe Lauro, Director, Candy Mancuso, Asst. Director	2/14	<i>[Signature]</i>	(see comments on p. 11) all comments throughout	com
2.	Using Department D.T. Minich, Director, CVB	2/19	<i>[Signature]</i>	see attached	com
Using Dept please check attached vendor list. Circle vendors you want bids mailed to. Add additional vendors with complete information (Name, Address, Phone and Fax)					
3.	Risk Management Attn: Loretta Hunter (Check applicable box at right)	2/25/08	<i>[Signature]</i>	See pg 11	com HIGH RISK <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> NOT HIGH RISK
4.	BCC Finance Attn: Cassandra Williams	2/27/08	<i>[Signature]</i>		
5.	Asst. County Administrator Attn: Liz Warren	2/29/08	<i>[Signature]</i>		
6.	Asst. County Administrator Attn: Mark Woodard	3/3/08	<i>[Signature]</i>	See various comments/p. 11	com
7.	Legal Attn: Michelle Wallace	3/4/08	<i>[Signature]</i>	Agreements Attached	com

****RETURN ALL DOCUMENTS TO PURCHASING****

Make all inquiries to:	Amelia McFarlane, CPPB Senior Procurement Analyst	at Extension 43149
In order to meet the following schedule, please return your requirements to Purchasing by: 2/27/08		

06/2006 (ag)

TENTATIVE DATES
Legal Ad-BID/RFP Mail Out: TBD
BID/RFP Opening: TBD
Board/County Admin/Purchasing Director Approval: TBD

PINELLAS COUNTY EVALUATION CRITERIA TABULATION SHEET

RFP TITLE: ADVERTISING & PROMOTIONAL SERVICES

RFP #: 078-0289-P

	COMPANY NAME	EVALUATOR LEE DANIEL	EVALUATOR RUSS KIMBALL	EVALUATOR DEBBIE MEIHLS	EVALUATOR DT MINICH	EVALUATOR DOREEN MOORE	EVALUATOR ANTHONY SATTEFIELD	TOTAL POINTS	TOTAL AVERAGE	RANK
1	Brogan & Partners	622.50	577.50	585.00	610.00	592.50	565.00	3552.50	592.08	13
2	BVK	975.00	975.00	975.00	975.00	975.00	975.00	5850.00	975.00	1
3	Dalton Agency	807.50	700.00	700.00	770.00	742.50	775.00	4495.00	749.17	6
4	Engauge Marketing, LLC	547.50	540.00	535.00	545.00	537.50	560.00	3265.00	544.17	14
5	Fahlgren, Inc.	762.50	755.00	755.00	750.00	765.00	790.00	4577.50	762.92	5
6	FKQ Advertising + Marketing	825.00	852.50	867.50	745.00	877.50	852.50	5020.00	836.67	2
7	Fry Hammond Barr, Inc.	727.50	745.00	720.00	705.00	717.50	770.00	4385.00	730.83	7
8	Marketing Innovations Enterprises, Inc.	95.00	115.00	105.00	130.00	95.00	95.00	635.00	105.83	15
9	MMG Worldwide	817.50	857.50	810.00	824.00	842.50	852.50	5004.00	834.00	3
10	Paradise Advertising & Marketing, Inc.	732.50	705.00	695.00	705.00	747.50	775.00	4360.00	726.67	8
11	PDG + Creative	110.00	105.00	95.00	115.00	95.00	95.00	615.00	102.50	16
12	Rick Johnson & Company, Inc.	725.00	700.00	702.50	727.50	735.00	710.00	4300.00	716.67	9
13	TURKEL	642.50	650.00	675.00	670.00	700.00	590.00	3927.50	654.58	11
14	Uzzell Group, Inc.	615.00	605.00	595.00	620.00	575.00	605.00	3615.00	602.50	12
15	Ypartnership, LLC	815.00	880.00	755.00	735.00	815.00	872.50	4872.50	812.08	4
16	The Zimmerman Agency	710.00	715.00	690.00	680.00	705.00	725.00	4225.00	704.17	10

Date: 5/8/2008

PINELLAS COUNTY EVALUATION CRITERIA TABULATION SHEET

RFP TITLE: Advertising & Promotional Services
RFP #: 078-0289-P

BEFORE DEMONSTRATION										AFTER DEMONSTRATION									
COMPANY NAME	EVALUATOR	EVALUATOR	EVALUATOR	EVALUATOR	EVALUATOR	EVALUATOR	TOTAL POINTS	TOTAL AVERAGE	RANK	EVALUATOR	EVALUATOR	EVALUATOR	EVALUATOR	EVALUATOR	EVALUATOR	TOTAL POINTS	TOTAL AVERAGE	RANK	
	Lee	Russ	Debbie	DT	Doreen	Tony				Lee	Russ	Debbie	DT	Doreen	Tony				
	Daniel	Kimball	Melhis	Minich	Moore	Satterfield	Before Demo	Before Demo	Before Demo	Daniel	Kimball	Melhis	Minich	Moore	Satterfield	After Demo	After Demo	After Demo	
1	FKQ Advertising + Marketing	825.00	852.50	867.50	745.00	877.50	852.50	5020.00	836.67	2	920.00	926.00	930.00	897.50	920.00	897.50	10511.00	1751.83	2
2	BVK	975.00	975.00	975.00	975.00	975.00	975.00	5850.00	975.00	1	816.65	863.65	864.15	871.65	861.65	876.65	11004.40	1834.07	1

Date: June 6, 2008